



# **CODRUL COSMINULUI**

New Series, Vol. XVIII, No.2, December 2012

## CONTENTS

### ELITES, RELIGION AND CULTURE

<a href="#"><u>Ismail Kose</u></a> , <i>Haghia Sophia in Trabzon</i> .....	169
<a href="#"><u>Tsvetana Tcholova</u></a> , <i>Spreading Bulgarian Medieval Manuscripts with Natural Science content in Wallachia and Moldova</i> .....	181
<a href="#"><u>Ioan Scripcariuc</u></a> , <i>State and church in the organization of Moldavian country until the end of 18th century</i> .....	191
<a href="#"><u>Vlad Gafita</u></a> , <i>Quelques considerations sur les elites et l'idee de nation en Austro-Hongrie</i> .....	203
<a href="#"><u>Bohdana Labinska</u></a> , <i>The peculiarities of the direct method usage in teaching speaking foreign languages in Galicia and Bukovina (1890-1918)</i> .....	219
<a href="#"><u>Pascal Boisson</u></a> , <i>L'armement charbonnier Marcesche (1898-1939)</i> .....	229
<a href="#"><u>Ionut Bran</u></a> , <i>The Ukrainian Movement in Bucovina. The Ukrainian National Party</i> .....	249

### INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

<a href="#"><u>Dariusz Milewski</u></a> , <i>A Campaign of the Great Hetman Jan Zamoyski in Moldavia (1595). Part I. Politico-diplomatic and military preliminaries</i> .....	261
<a href="#"><u>Viacheslav Tsivatyi</u></a> , <i>The institutionalization of the diplomatic service of the European states at the transition from the late Middle Ages to the Early Modern period (Theoretical and methodological aspects)</i> .....	287
<a href="#"><u>Gheorghe Onisoru</u></a> , <i>December 1944: A British Mission in northern Moldavia</i> .....	295
<a href="#"><u>Murat Yorulmaz</u></a> , <i>Russia's soft security policy: 2000 - 2012</i> .....	303
<a href="#"><u>Florin Pintescu, Adrian Botezatu</u></a> , <i>China at the beginning of 3rd millennium: geopolitical perspectives</i> .....	329

### POLITICS, CONFLICTS AND SOCIETY

<a href="#"><u>Marinel Ovidiu Koch-Tufis</u></a> , <i>Aspekte der Sozialpolitik der Habsburger in Siebenburgen (1688 - 1790). Massnahmen zur Erhohung der Anzahl der Einwohner des Furstentums</i> .....	347
<a href="#"><u>Daniel Hrenciuc</u></a> , <i>Czernowitz: the Jerusalem of Bukovina</i> .....	361
<a href="#"><u>Alina Felea</u></a> , <i>A delicate topic: inability of one of the spouses to pursue a conjugal life</i> .....	381
<a href="#"><u>Violeta-Anca Epure</u></a> , <i>Considerations sur l'alimentation des habitants des Principautes Roumaines dans la vision des consuls et des voyageurs francais de la periode d'avant 1848</i> .....	389



**Codrul Cosminului** - Analele Stiintifice ale Universitatii "Stefan cel Mare" din Suceava, Seria Istorie, este o revista care a obtinut recunoasterea CNCSIS (categoria B+).

Apare din anul 1995, reluand traditia publicatiei Universitatii din Cernauti din perioada interbelica (1924-1939).

Continutul revistei este pus in mod gratuit la dispozitia cititorilor. Utilizatorii pot citi, descarca, copia, distribui, imprima, cauta si realiza linkuri catre textele integrale ale articolelor publicate in revista fara permisiunea prealabila a editorului sau autorului.

ISSN: 1224-032X  
EISSN: 2067-5860

**Codrul Cosminului** - The Scientific Annals of the University "Stefan cel Mare" Suceava, History Section - is a journal classified in the B+ category by the National Council for Higher Education Research (CNCSIS).

Since 1995, it re-engages a tradition on publishing the Chernovcy University journal, that used to appear in the inter-war period (1924-1939).

All journal content is freely available without charge to the user or his/her institution. Users are allowed to read, download, copy, distribute, print, search, or link to the full texts of the articles in this journal without asking prior permission from the publisher or the author.

ISSN: 1224-032X  
EISSN: 2067-5860

Studiile publicate in volumele nr. 10-19 pot fi consultate on-line.

Revista este indexata in urmatoarele baze de date internationale:

- [Socionet](#)
- [Index Copernicus International](#)
- [Directory of Open Access Journals](#)
- [UlrichsWeb - Global Serials Directory](#)
- [European Reference Index for the Humanities. Discipline "History"](#)
- [Academic Journals Database](#)
- [Open Directory Project](#)

**Codrul Cosminului** a stabilit relatii de licentiere electronica cu [EBSCO](#), unul din cei mai prolifici la nivel mondial colectori de reviste, periodice si alte surse full text. Revista va fi identificata in baza de date EBSCO actualizata odata cu finalizarea procesului de completare a colectiei.

The studies published in volumes No. 10-19 can be found online.

The journal is indexed in the following international databases:

- [Socionet](#)
- [Index Copernicus International](#)
- [Directory of Open Access Journals](#)
- [UlrichsWeb - Global Serials Directory](#)
- [European Reference Index for the Humanities. Discipline "History"](#)
- [Academic Journals Database](#)
- [Open Directory Project](#)

**Codrul Cosminului** has entered into an electronic licensing relationship with [EBSCO](#), the world's most prolific aggregator of full text journals, magazines and other sources. The journal will be found on EBSCO's upgraded database once the collection is complete.

## HAGHIA SOPHIA IN TRABZON

**İsmail Köse**

Karadeniz Technical University-Turkey  
ismailkosestr@hotmail.com

**Rezumat:** Sfânta Sofia este o bisericuță localizată în NE Turciei. Din cauza dimensiunilor sale, în comparație cu cele ale Sf. Sofia din Istanbul, a primit numele de „Sf. Sofia cea mică”. Când sultanul Mehmed II Cuceritorul a adăugat Trapezuntul (Trabzon) la Imperiul Otoman, a transformat catedrala principală a orașului în moschee. El nu a transformat Haghia Sophia în moschee, deși era cea mai frumoasă construcție a Comnenilor. La peste 100 ani de la cucerire Haghia Sophia a fost convertită în moschee, după ce servise drept biserică peste 300 ani, fiind utilizată în calitate de moschee până la ocupația rusă din 1916. Perioada în care a fost folosită ca moschee a fost mai lungă decât cea în care Haghia Sophia a funcționat în calitate de biserică. După întemeierea Republicii Turcia, Sf. Sofia a continuat să funcționeze o perioadă în calitate de moschee iar frescele au fost acoperite cu tencuială albă, cu excepția unora curățate de către arheologul rus Uspensky, în timpul ocupației ruse. Restaurările efectuate la pictura murală în a doua jumătate a secolului al XX – lea au scos la suprafață fresce de o deosebită valoare artistică. Cele mai frumoase scene ale Sfintei Sofia sunt plasate în nartexul de sud-est. Aici atrag în mod deosebit atenția frizele ce prezintă momentul Creației lui Adam și a Evei. Turnul clopotniță este mai nou cu circa 200 de ani decât biserica, având în interior picturi murale deosebit de valoroase.

**Abstract:** Haghia Sophia is a small Church located to the North East of Turkey. Because of its dimensions when compared with Haghia Sophia in Istanbul it is called also “Small Haghia Sophia”. When Sultan Mehmet the Conqueror added Trabzon in the Ottoman Borders, He converted the main cathedral of city into a Mosque. However, he did not converted Haghia Sophia into a Mosque though it was the most beautiful building of Comnens. About one hundred years after the conquest, Haghia Sophia was converted into a mosque after it served as a church over 300 years and used as a mosque until the Russian occupation in 1916. The period of usage as a mosque was longer than that as a church.

After the foundation of modern Turkish Republic, Haghia Sophia continued to be used as a mosque for a while, and all frescos during this time were under white wash except some cleaned by Russian Archeologist Uspensky during Russian Occupation. The most beautiful carvings of Haghia Sophia are placed on the southern narthex, the frizzes showing the creation of Adam and Eva. The Bell Tower about 200 years younger than the main complex also includes elaborate paintings in the small cell at the middle.

**Résumé:** *Haghia Sophia était une petite église localisée au Nord-Est de la Turquie. A cause de ses dimensions, lorsqu'on fit la comparaison avec Haghia Sophia d'Istanbul, on lui donna le nom de "Petite Haghia Sophia". Lorsque le sultan Mahomet le Conquérant ajouta Trabzon, aussi, aux possessions de l'Empire Ottoman, il transforma la cathédrale principale de la ville en Mosquée. Pourtant, il ne transforma pas Haghia Sophia en Mosquée, quoique celle-ci fût le plus bel édifice des Commènes. Presque cent ans après la conquête, on transforma Haghia Sophia en mosquée, après avoir servi comme église presque 300 années. Elle fut utilisée en tant que mosquée jusqu'à l'occupation russe de 1916. La période d'usage comme mosquée fut plus longue que celle d'église.*

*Après la fondation de la République Turque moderne, Haghia Sophia continua à être utilisée comme mosquée pour une certaine période de temps et toutes les fresques furent couvertes toute cette période par une couche blanche de chaux, excepté quelques-unes nettoyées par l'archéologue russe Uspensky pendant l'occupation russe. Les plus belles représentations de Haghia Sophia se trouvent sur la nef sud: il s'agit des frises montrant la création d'Adam et Eve. La tour de la cloche est plus jeune avec 200 années que le complexe principal et inclut de peintures élaborées dans la petite chambre du milieu.*

**Keywords:** *Haghia Sofia Church, Trabzon, Byzantine Empire, Ottoman Empire, Russia, architecture, religious paintings.*

## Introduction

Anatolia boasts three Haghia Sophias which have great importance for Christianity. One of them is the most renowned Byzantine cathedral, the Haghia Sophia of Istanbul being an architectural masterpiece with its enormous height and large dome (325-360 AD). Its construction has begun during the reign of Constantine and completed by his son Constantine the II<sup>nd</sup>; it was opened for worshipping in 360.<sup>1</sup> The Second important temple called Haghia Sophia is Iznik (*Niceea*) Haghia Sophia; it was built by Emperor Justinian in the VI<sup>th</sup> centuries. Even though it is not as big or as architecturally important as the Istanbul Haghia Sophia, it is also very important for Christianity because The First Ecumenical Council of Christianity in 325 AD discussing Trinity had summoned in Iznik, and The Seventh Ecumenical Council in 787 AD was held in this temple under the leadership of Patriarch Tarasios. During the Seventh Ecumenical Council especially, serious disputes broke out regarding iconoclast and gaps in the Christian faith deepened. Decisions were made on some basic principles of Christianity during this Council.<sup>2</sup>

The third Haghia Sophia is located at the far eastern side of both, at a spot that could be assumed to be the far end of Anatolia. It is Trabzon Haghia Sophia (also

<sup>1</sup> Yücel Akal, *İstanbul*, Keskin Color Kartpostalılık San. ve Paz. A.Ş., 2007 İstanbul. p.30.

<sup>2</sup> Jane Taylor, *İmparatorlukların Başkenti İstanbul* [Capital of Empires İstanbul], Arkeoloji ve Sanat Yayınları, Kanaat Basımevi, 2000, İstanbul, p. 360.

known as Small Haghia Sophia), which was built outside the city walls, by Comnenus King Manuel I (1238-1263), in a Byzantine province style, with a Georgian conical dome, Seljuk stone carving and embroidery harmonized in its construction. The stone works, carvings and construction of the temple brought together different national and cultural art styles. Especially at the southern narthex entrance of Trabzon Haghia Sophia the embroideries are unique and special to this temple. Haghia Sophia means "Sacred Wisdom" meanwhile in Christianity it is one of Jesus names.

In the year of 1204, the Trabzon state was built with contributions by the Georgian Queen Tamara to the Comnenus Dynasty, and in a short time they established alliances by marriage, in order to assure their continued existence. At its very beginning they fought against the Byzantine state founded in Iznik and established alliances with and paid taxes to Anatolian Seljuks and Mongols. To break free from the Mongol's governance in the reign of Manuel I, they tried to establish kinship with France with a marriage of a Comnenus princess to the French King Louis, but France did not care about this proposal. Later again, through marriage, close relationship and cooperation have been established with the Byzantine Paleologos dynasty.<sup>3</sup> All of these different and complicated political relationships made their mark on the Trabzon art and architecture. The most important one of these, in regard to Haghia Sophia's history is the Anatolian Seljuk, whose influence can easily be seen on the ornamentation.

When Comnenus initially founded Trabzon state centered from Batumi to Samsun, the first king Alexious attacked the Byzantine state's newly crowned king Laskaris in Iznik. But on his campaign, near Samsun, he came across the Seljuk Sultan Keykavus army who was in control of this region. After Sinop's fall to the Seljuk, an agreement was signed between them and Alexious who agreed to be under the governance of Seljuks and pay tribute. In 1244, after Kosedag Battle, Trabzon state allied with the Mongols and after the collapse of political union in Anatolia, came under the governance of Mongols. Those years coincide with the date of Haghia Sophia's construction.

Trabzon Haghia Sophia is located at the right side of the state road entering the city from the west and about 2 km distance from the so-called old city, inside of Middle Forest. Haghia Sophia and the Bell Tower added at a later date were built on a rock cape, at a spot overlooking the sea side on the site of a former Roman Basilica. But due to the silting up of the sea over time, and because of the construction of the state coastal road here, the Haghia Sophia and Bell Tower are about half km away from the sea side. Talbot Rice says that at the place where Haghia Sophia was built<sup>4</sup>

<sup>3</sup> Talbot Tamara Rice, *Trabzon Ayasofya'sındaki Selçuklu Üslubunda Süslemeler* [Seljuk Style Ornaments in Trabzon Hagia Sophia], Çev. Solmaz Turunç, Bir Tutkudur Trabzon, Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1. Baskı 1997, İstanbul, p. 72.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 71-73.

there was a former Monastery complex.

Even though Haghia Sophia is a Byzantine building, as mentioned before, due to the complicated political relations of the Comnenos dynasty, its ornaments and architecture carry eclectic elements. On the southern front there is a series of irrelevant stone ornaments whose features resemble XII<sup>th</sup> century churches in the Vladimir-Suzdal region of Russia, especially in Vladimir, as in the much more carefully ornamented stone embossing on the front of the Church of St. Dimitri, dated 1195-1200.<sup>5</sup> Considering the close relationship and kinship between Trabzon State and the Georgian Kingdom, and the obvious Georgian influence on those ornaments, the stone carvings and embossing on the southern front do not carry the same features. Two of those stones are definitely in the Seljuk style and another one partly. At the entrance of the Western front ex-Narthex there are nine stones carved and ornamented in Seljuk style. At Haghia Sophia especially *mukarnas*\* works on the column capitals reflect Seljuk art style features, two of most commonly used elements of Seljuk art: star and rosette motifs can frequently be observed. Motifs on the lower register of southern moulding second (figure-1) from the left and at the right side of the northern brim (figure-2) have the same specialties and appearance of a more carefully carved group of motif variations of Divrigi Ulu Mosque and Hospital *Darussifa* built almost at the same time 1228.<sup>6</sup>

To Rice although exo-narthex of Haghia Sophia and north entrance face stone mould ornaments have been influenced by Seljuk fabric and carpets, they are exactly the same as Seljuk stone work and wood carving features. The main entrance in the south is the most important and ornamented section of the building. Masonry and ornaments are predominantly Seljuk and Islamic artwork on the facade. The north entrance hosts eight stone carvings in Seljuk style besides the interior walls. As a result, motifs seen in Haghia Sophia are splendid examples of Seljuk ornamentations to be found in Divrigi, the very end of the west border of the Seljuks. Islamic art found in Haghia Sophia ornamentations is identical to that found in Anatolian Seljuks' XIII<sup>th</sup> century buildings. In those days the fame of the Seljuk stonework extended to Kherson and that kind of ornamentation was in fashion.<sup>7</sup>

Haghia Sophia gives its name to a quarter in the city and it is next to the quarter called "Fatih" which means the "Conqueror". The name comes from Sultan Mehmet the Conqueror.

Haghia Sophia was built in 1250–1260 at the time of Manuel Comnenus I, (1238–1263) one of the Trabzon state kings. It was built on a terrace of a Roman

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 73.

\* *Mukarnas: A Turkish ornamentation resembling Central Asian Turkish tents, used in the portals of Caravansaries, Madrasahs and Mosques.*

<sup>6</sup> Rice, *op. cit.*, p. 77.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 86.



pagan temple of Apollo. The three-apse ruined chapel located in the north yard must be an earlier one. The plan of Haghia Sophia is squared-cross shape, with four columns carrying the high main conical dome. Eastern openings of side naves are barrel-vaulted, the long openings on the west are covered by cross-vaults. The barrel vaulted roof in the north is longer than the southern and thus a lengthwise appearance has been given to the building resembling domed basilicas. Moreover, in three directions the three entrances (porticos) opening with three arches solely are essential architectural components and this peculiarity marks the difference between Haghia Sophia and traditional Byzantine architecture.<sup>8</sup>

As a fine example of late Byzantine building, it has a high centered dome and a narthex with three naves. The nave in the middle has five cornered semi-circle apse and the ones on both sides end in round apse. John Freely mentions that the apse in the south is *diaconicon* or is the room in which relics were kept. The room in the north is for *prothesis* namely Communion-*Cudas* ritual preparations. The place next to the *diaconicon* has not been paved and it is believed to be the burial place of Manuel Comnenus I.<sup>9</sup> The west end has a chapel and a narthex the same size with the western portal. South, north and west narthexes have been covered with barrel vault and opened outside with three arches carried by two arched columns. Portal columns and their capitals are all reused marble and they date back to different dates prior to the V<sup>th</sup> century. Four impost capitals used in the building having same typology are unique and extremely well ornamented. The bunch grapes, vegetable patterns in Sasanid fashion cover the entire body. Similar capitals to those in Haghia Sophie have been found nearby Topkapı Palace. The capitals show the VI<sup>th</sup> century Byzantine art and they must be carved in Capital and brought to Trabzon. Porticos at the three sides have been used before and gathered capitals at their entrances. There are two composite capitals to the south and two pane typed capitals to the north.<sup>10</sup>

Reliefs on friezes over south face were carved on different stones and the *Genesis* scene (Old Testament) is pictured. The key stone has an open-winged single-headed eagle- *aetos* looking towards east.<sup>11</sup> It symbolizes the Comnenus Kingdom that ruled Trabzon for 257 years. A similar eagle pattern is situated on the exterior

<sup>8</sup> Sadi Dilaver, *Tarihsel Yapılarıyla Trabzon, Bir Tutkudur Trabzon* [Trabzon with its Historical Buildings], Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1997 İstanbul, 1. Baskı. p. 87-88.

<sup>9</sup> John Freely, *Türkiye Uygarlıklar Rehberi 2, Marmara Etrafında Karadeniz Kıyısı* [Turkey Civilizations Guide 2, Around Marmara and Black Sea Coast], Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 4. Baskı, 2008 İstanbul, p. 126-128.

<sup>10</sup> Bilban Yalçın Asnu, *Trabzon'da Erken Bizans Dönemi Mimari Plastik Eserler Üzerine Değerlendirmeler* [Evaluations of Trabzon Early Byzantine Architectural Plastic Carvings], Karadeniz Tarihi Sempozyumu (25-26 Mayıs 2008) Bildirileri, KTÜ Yayını, I. Cilt, 2007 Trabzon. p. 41-42.

<sup>11</sup> Jakop Philip Fallmerayer, *Doğu'dan Fragmanlar* [Fragments from the East], İmge Kitabevi, Çeviren; Hüseyin Salihoğlu, 2002, p. 97.



walls of the main apse.\* Just below the key stone are the doves looking towards east and west, square frames with a star and crescent, centaur and griffon (apocalyptic creatures) figures from Bible, arabesques, spiral ornaments, grape leaves and bunches representing fertility in Christianity and all of them were decorated with great mastery.<sup>12</sup>

Surprisingly, similar to the Turkish flag, the relief showing the moon and the sun shaped star should not be considered a Hellenic, Roman, Seljuk or Georgian symbol but a Mithra cult religious symbol which existed in the Black Sea culture for thousands of years. The Mithra symbol could be seen on coins of Pontus Emperor Mithrates who lived centuries before Haghia Sophia was built. Ahura Mazda and Zoroastrian cult is the origin of the symbol. The crescent represents the night and wickedness whilst the sun represents goodness. "The sun prayer" relating to this cult has continued recently on the highlands in the Black Sea area. D. Talbot Rice, in his book "Haghia Sophia" says that: the exterior walls of Haghia Sophia have ship carvings made by Mediterranean sailors who believed that God would bring them luck and protect them while fishing and sailing. The carvings are dated 1450-1850's and it is not clear by whom they were carved or for what purpose. It is thought that they were carved by different sailors probably because they believed the local people are blessed, and because they wanted God's help whilst sailing.

The interior walls of the southern portal host faded frescoes. The eastern portal wall has a verse of The Holy Koran saying: "*And that the mosques are Allah's, therefore call not upon any one with Allah*" (Cin, 72/18).<sup>13</sup>

The space under the central dome was covered with nine different coloured marble called *opus sectile*.\* To the north, west and southern entrances of the temple there are three porticos. The frame of the dome is a dodecagon having twelve corners reminding the twelve apostles. Events from the Bible were depicted in the frescoes of Haghia Sophia. The frescoes are fairly good examples of Byzantine Renaissance art.

The building, according to Evliya Celebi's record, was converted into a mosque in 1577 following the conquest of Trabzon by Sultan Mehmet the Conqueror and became a Foundation-*Vakf*. Haghia Sophia attracted travelers and researchers for centuries. Evliya Celebi, (1648) famous for his travels talks about Trabzon in his

---

\* Double Headed Eagle Motif: Byzantine Empire's state symbol was double headed eagle representing Eastern and Western Rome. The double headed eagle motif has been used in Anatolia long before Byzantines. For instance, the entrance in Bogazkoy, the capital of the oldest known Empire of Anatolia, the Hittite Empire, hosts double headed eagle motif. Seljuks also used double headed eagle motif as their state symbol.

<sup>12</sup> Fallmerayer, *op. cit*, p. 95.

<sup>13</sup> *The Holy Koran*, Cin Surah, 72/18.

\* Opus Sectile: Stone or marble inlay or tiling using pieces of cut to follow the outline of the design.

well-known book “*Seyahatname-travels*”: “*Haghia Sophia is by the sea. It was built at a time of unbelievers, later a governor and philanthropist informs the Sultan about the building and by the decree of the sultan it was converted into a mosque and used for that purpose from then on*”.<sup>14</sup>

Haghia Sophia was visited and mentioned in diaries and memories. The ruined building was restored with a donation from Rıza Efendi in 1864. The building served as a depot and hospital at the time of Russian invasion. Russian Archeologist F. I. Uspensky arranged some excavations around the building and unearths some of the frescos. Uspensky was charged to collect and classify historical monuments of Trabzon. After the occupation it was turned into mosque again. 1958-1962 are the years when the building saw a proper joint restoration by Edinburgh University and Charity Directorate of Turkey. All frescoes were cleaned, restored, and Haghia Sophia opened to visits as a museum.

### Bell Tower

British traveler and researcher G. Finlay dates the building of the Bell Tower from 1426 to 1427. It is unique – there are no others the same in Byzantine churches. Set 25 meters to the west, the tower is in Venetian style. Frescoes inside the tower were restored by the Russell Trust in 1961. Papadopoulos adds that the tower served as an observatory and hosted lectures on astronomy. It was probably also used as a lighthouse. One of the Comnenus kings, Kalo Johannes, who could not bear his father and predecessor Alexios IV, living a long life and caprices killed him, and ascended the throne and had this event portrayed with himself over the eastern face of the Bell Tower.<sup>15</sup> Only traces of this fresco have survived today, being indistinguishable.

J. P. Fallmerayer mentions about the Bell Tower that: “*The bell tower having a short narrow mouth has 120 feet height, at twelve steps distance to the church, built as isolated on a cliff terrace by the sea. It is in rectangle shape, the stone steps leading to entrance built twenty steps above ground have been partly broken. The entrance directly enters into a frescoes cell and resembles a small temple. Besides interior frescoes are liturgics also there are figures of clergies passed away here. There is a semi circle outer part resembling a mosque’s niche. The year inscribed in accordance with Byzantine calendar shows the date of 6941 and with modern calendar this date is 1433*”.<sup>16</sup>

The Bell Tower today hosts fairly well preserved frescoes and by the ladders situated inside it is possible to climb up to the fresco cell. The niche Fallmerayer

<sup>14</sup> Zekeriya Kurşun, *Evliya Çelebi Seyahatnamesinde Trabzon, Bir Tutkudur Trabzon* [Trabzon in Evliya Celebi’s Travel Book], Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1997 İstanbul, p. 216-217.

<sup>15</sup> Freely, *op. cit.*, p. 127.

<sup>16</sup> Fallmerayer, *op. cit.*, p. 96.

talks about is visible from the outside. The explanations of the Bell Tower frescoes will be given later.

### The Frescoes of the Haghia Sophia

In Haghia Sophia the paintings visible at present owe their existence mostly to the Ottoman Empire's indulgence. Because the policy of the Ottomans while converting churches into mosques was not to obliterate the paintings but just cover them with a white paint allowing numerous frescoes to carry their original colour, quality and magnificence to the present day. All paintings in Haghia Sophia have been cleaned and exposed today. The most well preserved paintings exist today in the main body of the church, in the narthex to the west and in the chapel of the Bell Tower which stands not far from the west door. At Haghia Sophia the *narrative cycle* has been followed in a range of paintings. Like Sumela Monastery's rock church's eastern masonry, some scenes in the aisle have been repeated at the narthex to the west. When ruins on arched vaults and walls were investigated carefully it was easily observed that, once upon a time the internal area of the church was entirely covered by paintings.

Though there is no inscription showing the date of paintings, D. Talbot Rice points out that the style used shows clearly enough that they belong at the latest to the XIII<sup>th</sup> and probably to the XIV<sup>th</sup> centuries and the paintings already suggest the manner of the Byzantine revival.

At Haghia Sophia the paintings are of considerable interest regarding style and iconography. The colouring is also less fine, though it is considerably developed. Behind full length figures there are black and dark green backgrounds and have inky black, thunderous skies, which appear behind the scenes. There is a general sense of depth and space and a definite attempt at modeling, which may perhaps be due to western influence. This would be easily conveyed by means of Venetian or Genoese trading, throughout the mid XV<sup>th</sup> century.

The work essentially reflects features of local schools, though the paintings are nevertheless very well executed. The paintings have the attraction of being well preserved and owe this to being plastered over by the Ottomans. Inscriptions and signs show that especially in the bell tower paintings were executed by two monks and this shows that the artists were capable of executing this work well on into the XV<sup>th</sup> century. This case proves that, early wall-painters or artists living in Trabzon were doubtlessly professionals.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Millet, Gabriel and Rice, D. Talbot, *Byzantine Painting at Trebizond*, Published by Acedemie Des Inscriptions at Belles-Lettres and University of London, 1<sup>st</sup> Published in 1936. p. 95.

Starting Haghia Sophia's paintings explanation from plastic friezes placed at the southern Narthex's outer wall surface will make the work easier. Nevertheless, the ornaments on the southern Narthex are not frescoes, as it was told before, but they are majestic and marvelous.

### **Friezes on the southern narthex wall**

Information about ornaments on the southern Narthex wall has been given before. Almost under the keystone, there is a Comnenus State symbol, single headed eagle, looking to the east. Under this eagle, holy in Christianity and representing the Holy Spirit, there are two pigeons with tails entwined. It is said they also symbolize peace and friendship in the lands. At both sides of the cubic cross shaped window there are crescent and stars based on the Mythra cult and under them there is a sundial. Though one of them to the west has fallen down over time, at both sides there are apocalyptic creature figures and under both there is an inscription register. Below the inscription register, creation scenes from the Old Testament's Book of Genesis are carved symmetrically. The scene is carved from right to left by viewing angle. In the Monastery of Sumela the same scenes are painted, but this time depiction starts from left to right. Nowadays both of them include a very detailed narration. The Genesis scene in Sumela has the advantage of being painted, depicted in a more detailed and understandable manner. In Sumela also, creation of the earth, located in the first register on the east side surface is depicted very well. From right to left, although the first scene has partly lost its features, it animates the creation of Adam and Eve.

According to the Book of Genesis from the Old Testament, God made the man (Adam) from the dust of the ground and breathed into his nostrils the breath of life. Later he had planted a garden in the east, in Eden and there he put the man he had made. In the first scene of the frieze, man's creation and plants in the garden God created are animated. A river watering the garden flowed from Eden; from there it was separated into four headwaters by the names Pishon, Gihon, Tigris and Euphrates. Man had been commanded that he was free to eat from any tree in the garden except the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, for when he would eat of it he would surely die.

One day, God caused the man to fall into a deep sleep; and while he was sleeping, he took one of the man's ribs and closed up the place with flesh. Then the God made a woman (Eve) from the rib he had taken out of the man. The serpent was craftier than any of the wild animals God had made. One day the serpent came to the woman and deceiving her told her that if she would eat fruit from the prohibited tree she would be like God, knowing good and evil. The women ate the fruit and also gave some to her husband and he also ate it. In the third scene from right to left, the serpent deceiving the woman can easily be seen. Until this time man and woman were naked



and had felt no shame. Then, the eyes of both of them were opened, and they realized they were naked so they sewed fig leaves together and made coverings for themselves. In the last scene on the first part of the frieze, fig leaves show the shame of Adam and Eve and their struggle to make coverings for themselves. Adam named his wife Eve because she would become the mother of all the living. As a punishment for not listening God's command, they were both expelled from the Garden of Eden to work the ground from which man had been taken. Adam and Eve first had a son named Cain and later another son named Abel. Cain was working the soil and Abel was keeping flocks. When they offered their offerings to God, Cain was stingy and brought some of the fruits of the soil whereas Abel had brought an offering from some of the firstborn of his flock. Cain's offerings were not accepted by God, whilst Abel's were favored. Cain was very angry, and his face was downcast and one day he killed his brother in the field. On the frieze in the last scene, the standing figure is Cain killing his brother and the figure lying on the ground is Abel killed by him.<sup>18</sup>

If we compare Creation with Islamic Sources we come across with partly similar story. Whereas, differing at some points, the creation of Adam and Eve in Islam is partly similar to the story in the Old Testament. After the creation of the universe, Allah commands angels to bring mud from the earth and creates Adam, breaths him from His soul and impersonates him. In The Holy Koran's Ali Imran Surah it is clearly pointed out that Adam was created from the earth.<sup>19</sup> Because Adam was created by dust from the earth he is named Adam. Adam was created and put into heaven on Friday. Contrary to other angels Satan *Iblis* refuses to prostrate himself before Adam and argues that he is superior because he was created from fire while Adam had been created from clay. While Adam was walking around alone in heaven he was put into a deep sleep by Allah and Eve was created from his left rib bone to be a follow to him. When Adam awoke he is surprised to see Eve and asks her who she is.

Because she was created from a living being she was named Eve. Adam and Eve, as spouses lived together in heaven for a while. They were allowed to eat any fruit of each tree, except for one of them and both had been warned about Satan. One day, Satan whispers evil to Adam saying: "*But the Shaitan made an evil suggestion to him; he said: O Adam! Shall I guide you to the tree of immortality and a kingdom which decays not?*"<sup>20</sup> (Taha, 20/120). First Eve eats the forbidden fruit and tells her husband Adam that nothing bad had happened to her, so Adam to also eats the fruit. After eating the fruit, their nakedness appears to them, they began to sew leaves together from Heaven to cover themselves. Both are expelled from Heaven on to the earth on a Friday. It is told that Adam was sent to a place named Serendip in the Nevz

<sup>18</sup> *Old Testament*, The Bible Society in Turkey, 2006 İstanbul, Genesis, Chapter 1:26. p. 3-6.

<sup>19</sup> *The Holy Koran*, Ali Imran- 3/59.

<sup>20</sup> *The Holy Koran*, Taha, 20/120.

Mountains in India while Eve was sent to Jeddah in Arabia.<sup>21</sup>

In Islamic sources Adam and Eves' sons' birth and names differ from the Old Testament. The first born son's name is not Cain but Kabil. Also, according to Islam sources their children were born each time as twins one male and one female. In the Old Testament there is no such information about female's birth and Cain was born alone. Each time Eve gives birth to a twin one male and one female, the first time twins, Kabil and his sister Lubud were born. The second time twins Abel and his sister Iklima were born. In accordance with Divine command first born daughter and subsequently born son can marry each other and vice versa. Twins were not allowed to marry each other. Kabil's sister Lubud was more beautiful than Abel's sister Iklima, and disobeying Divine order Kabil desired to marry his twin sister Lubud.<sup>22</sup> The dispute goes on between the two and their father Adam tells them to offer sacrifice to Allah and the one whose sacrifice is accepted by Allah would have the right. Farmer Kabil offers his mostly unqualified products, while Abel offers his best sheep in the Nevz Mountains. Whereas Abel's offer was accepted by Allah, Kabil's was refused. Kabil was angry because of this and when Abel was sleeping while his flocks were feeding, Kabil arrives there and strikes Abel's head with a stone and kills his brother. Thus the first murder on the earth was committed by Kabil.

### Conclusion

Trabzon Haghia Sophia is one of the three special buildings of Turkey bearing the title of "Haghia Sophia". Commens had built it to show their power and loyalty to Christianity, Ottoman also respected this at the very beginning of conquest.

According to Trabzon Tourism and Culture Directorate's statistic, in the year of 2012 including the month of August, 87.9674 domestic and 10.900 foreign visitors came to see Haghia Sophia. The total number of visitors in 2012, until the beginning of September is 98.876.

Since 1962 Haghia Sophia is an open air museum, and still there are very beautiful samples of late Byzantine renaissance stylized frescoes. Unfortunately, there are some newly erected buildings around the monument, but the Municipality of Trabzon put in force a plan cleaning all them out. When it was built, Haghia Sophia was siding Black Sea whereas today it is about 500m far from the sea, due to high way construction on filled areas.

As an 800 years old building, with its remaining frescoes, plastic frizzes and Latin stylized bell tower, Haghia Sophia witness the history of Trabzon. Its garden as an open air museum includes tombstones from Romans to Ottomans, stone carved

<sup>21</sup> Köksal, M. Asım, *Peygamberler Tarihi* [History of Prophets], Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı, 10. Baskı, 1. Cilt, 2007 Ankara, p. 29-44.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 50-51.

donation boxes, church, pagan temple and mosque columns, capitals and ornaments belonging to several civilizations that have passed through the area.

This paper, focused on the history of Haghia Sophia, is trying to say some words about its paintings, especially the plastic frizzes on the southern narthex. Those frizzes are carved on 22 block stones. Despite the fact that they were carved about 800 years ago and the area faced several wars from that time until the present day, they are in fairly good order.

We don't know the exact date when the building was converted into a mosque, but we are sure that it was not converted in the time of the conquest of Trabzon. There are still going on arguments on the date given by Evliya Çelebi but 1577 overcomes with historical events of the era and must be correct or at least it is a more reasonable date than other suggestions.